The "N" Word of Costa Rica

Educational Challenges and Identity Formation by Nicaraguan Immigrants in Costa Rica

BRENDAN BLOWERS

Final Report

Dr. Doug Henry

May 28, 2011

Introduction

Laura is the oldest girl in the Ramo Ruíz family, and she will be graduating from elementary school soon. I ask her mom if they are going to try to get her into high school, but her eyes widen and she shakes her head "no" emphatically. As the education of the children in this family is highly valued, as well as for many children in this area, I probed her for a reason she wouldn't try getting her daughter into high school.

"She'll get a cell phone, talk to boys, and end up pregnant," her mom explained. "Better to put her in some sort of trade school, so she'll have a marketable skill and won't have time to get mixed up in all that stuff."[1]

I consider this for a moment, because it's the opposite of what I advocate strongly to the kids with whom I work in this shantytown. I never thought that a family, acting in their best interests, would intentionally keep a child out of high school. I hadn't considered, though, that the options for high school available to Laura might do her more harm than good. Their caution makes sense, for even more reasons than the ones her mother gave. Laura's family became permanent immigrants to Costa Rica from Nicaragua about seventeen years ago, meaning Laura was born in Costa Rica and thus had all the same rights as any other Costa Rican child. However, as a child of immigrants she was going to face a number of obstacles her Costa Rican classmates would not face, one of these being unequal opportunities to quality education; another being the difficult process of negotiating her identity from within the Costa Rican educational system in a way her classmates probably would not have to.

---

[1] This is a paraphrase of a longer conversation we had regarding the topic of her daughter's education (personal communication, December 2010)

I've encountered other reasons that high school isn't seen as a practical option for Nicaraguan families living in Costa Rica. Many kids *aren't* as lucky as Laura to have Costa Rican birth certificates – so legally, they have to jump through complex loopholes and endless paperwork to even get a possibility of continuing their studies. For some it is not worth it. Another thing that would happen is that every few months, kids would disappear from the computer class I teach, and I'd find out they'd gone back to Nicaragua for a few weeks with their families. Other kids are quickly pressured into helping support their family economically, a sound decision in the short run, since further schooling also requires books, supplies, uniforms, and bus fees, at an age when kids could already be performing small jobs to bring in a little more income.

It can be shown through a variety of ways that Nicaraguan immigrant households in Costa Rica face considerably difficult challenges, many of which go beyond the normal challenges that face the Costa Rican poor. Education is a valued national service to the country's children, and it is valued by Nicaraguans living in Costa Rica as well. However, the country now has more children needing its services, yet less funding, resources, and political support than previous years. Reformed education policies need to increase funding and resources to fit the current needs of the country's children, include the particular needs of immigrants living in the country, and work toward including them in the country's national identity.

Structural, Material, and Political Challenges to Nicaraguan Migrants in Costa Rica

According to the 1967 United Nations Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees, a refugee is any person who "owing to a well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, is outside the

country of his nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country" (as quoted in Mahler 1995:175). Persons seeking political asylum are those who apply for legal sanctuary in another country from within the country to which they have fled. Definitions of "migrants" are problematic, and strict definitions to distinguish between "migrants" and "refugees" and other types of displaced persons often are employed to deny services and assistance to movements of people seeking relief and protection (Grundy-Warr and Wong 94:2002). The traditional definition holds international migration to be a change in country of habitual residence (Barquero and Vargas 2004:55). Costa Rica has been a prime candidate for housing refugees, the majority at present being of Columbian origin. Two decades ago in 1985, the UNHRC listed 17,000 refugees in the country, and the National Commission for Refugees (CONAPARE) listed 19,008. Of the 19,008 figure, 54% were Nicaraguan, 32% from El Salvador, 13% from Guatemala, and the remaining 1% from other countries (Basok 1993:27). In fact, the internal conflict within Nicaragua changed the motivations for flight, and thus the destination changed as well. Before the 1970's, most Nicaraguans came to Costa Rica. In the seventies and eighties, during civil unrest, an increased number tried to reach the United States. Once the conflict had settled down, refugees began coming to Costa Rica again (Fruttero and Wennerholm 2008:5). These statistics, however, are strictly documented refugees; migrants and undocumented seekers of amnesty are not included in the UNHCR's numbers.

Currently, economic refugees far surpass the numbers of "official" refugees in Costa Rica, many of these being of Nicaraguan origin. Migration was for different reasons in 1979, when 50,000 Nicaraguans fled persecution from the Somoza regime. Many of these refugees returned after the Somoza government was overthrown by the Sandinista movement later that year. By 1985, there were 10,250 refugees from Nicaragua (Basok 1993:27), but the unofficial

count in the 80's is estimated closer to 200,000 (Nygren 2003:375). Internal unrest, then, was initially a large push for many refugees fleeing to Costa Rica. However, lingering effects of the violence and displacement from the civil war in the 1980's carried over into the 90's, and a different type of suffering occurred which was "characterized by socio-political polarization and economic destitution" (Nygren 2003:368). Nygren (2003) also documents various sociological symptoms and somatic illnesses that persist in regions of Nicaragua as a result of violent conflict in the 80's.

Nicaraguan immigration into Costa Rica spiked in the 90's and leveled off in the subsequent decade. By 2005, Nicaraguans living in Costa Rica had leveled off at about 300,000 people, which is about 7% of the country's population (Marquette 2006:2). This is based partly on an estimate of Nicaraguans living in the country during peak agricultural times, because the 2000 census calculates 200,000 Nicaraguans in Costa Rica (3). After Haiti, Nicaragua is the second poorest country in the Western Hemisphere, with 48% of the population categorized as poor, and 17% extremely poor (Nygren 2003:370). There are far more opportunities for employment, decent health care, and education in Costa Rica, making the move to Costa Rica a "rational and progressive economic decision" within the modernization perspective (Brettell 2000:102). The move certainly entails some degree of risk, but the benefits for immigrants may seem to outweigh the costs in terms of the discrimination and hardships they will face. The level of poverty for Nicaraguans living in Costa Rica is far lower than in Nicaragua, but is far more prevalent for Nicaraguan households compared to Costa Rican households (Marquette 2006:12). Because Nicaraguans are almost evenly divided between rural regions in the north and in the San Jose/Central Valley region, spatially there is not an uneven burdening of the city. However, there is "a clear pattern of labor market segmentation," and Nicaraguans tend to fill lower-paying

occupational sectors in the city and countryside. Nicaraguan men concentrate in construction

jobs in San José and women in domestic service (Marquette 2006:6).

The division of labor fits well within the theoretical construct of dual labor market

theory, in which preferential jobs go to the core (well-educated, elite locals) and less desirable

jobs with fewer benefits on the periphery are filled by groups with less power – immigrants, the

poor, or uneducated. In this way, the class division of labor becomes institutionalized (Mahler

1995:8-9). In the case of Nicaraguans in Costa Rica, this happens not by race or ethnicity but by

the level of training and education to which one has access. Uneducated workers will only have

access to certain job sectors and, in the case of undocumented workers, have little say regarding

their working conditions. Native workers can be selective and choose jobs with better working

conditions and benefits. Immigrant workers may lack the skills and legal status to have a choice

(Mahler 1995:117). Undocumented workers also fill sectors of the economy that are unregulated,

such as day labor jobs, agriculture, domestic service, and privately contracted security. Without

more consideration given to the neglected pockets of the educational system, this inequitable

labor division will be reproduced in the following generation of immigrant children. And, at the

risk of repeating the blare of the doomsday trumpet that intellectual populism and mass media

outlets continually employ, these conditions can eventually give rise to "cultures of resistance"

that are described by Philippe Bourgois and Joan Moore, in which "mainstream institutions such

as the school and the church are supplanted by institutions within the culture of resistance, such

as drug dealing, violence, gangs, and prostitution" (Mahler 1995:136)[2].

---

[2] Many of the articles I read describe how the media and intellectual populism are already misrepresenting immigrant and minority communities as overrun by delinquency and illicit economies. This is a discursive tactic used to push what is not seen as natively "Costa Rican" further into the margins. At the risk of perpetuating this exaggeration, I include references to the formation of a "culture of resistance" only to describe it as a social process that can be circumvented by the provision of legitimate social services (such as education).

Most Nicaraguan migrants are long-term permanent migrants, but some are seasonal, temporary, or circular (Marquette 2006:2-3). They can get temporary job permissions for work such as domestic service, agriculture, and agroindustry jobs – but these do not allow them to apply for residency. Having a child born in Costa Rica, however, does (Sandoval 2009:156). This has important implications for schooling. Especially for the northern region of the country, seasonal migration can be very disruptive. This may be less likely in the city, but as in the case of the children I talked with, even periodic visits to relatives in Nicaragua or emergency trips relating to irregular migratory status have consequences for enrollment.

Social Stigmatization and the "N" Word

When I was six years old, I began kinder-garden in this nice school with a
good and kind teacher. In my first years at school, I was not badly treated
for being Nicaraguan. I did not even know I was Nicaraguan. After
listening to so many insults about Nicaraguans in school, I asked my
mother about the province [of Costa Rica] where I had been born.
[When she said I was Nicaraguan] I burst into tears; I could not accept
being Nicaraguan. I was afraid of being insulted or laughed at in school,
like other Nicaraguans are. But time has passed and I have been accepting
my nationality more even though I haven't been there [to Nicaragua] and
I don't know anything about Nicaragua. Up to now I feel happy to know
that at school and at home I am treated well. I realised that all people are
equal before God.

This short reflection is from an essay submission by a girl finishing primary school. The author of the article from which it was taken notes that "Nicaraguan children face the challenge of negotiating their identities" (Sandoval 2004:441). As children of one or more immigrants, their identity is formed from within a "third space," one that is neither fully Nicaraguan, nor fully Costa Rican (or arguably, both!). Their legal status may be established in one country or the other; their childhoods may have been lived out between both countries or fully in one that is not the same as their parents nor their birthplace. The lived immigration experience is often made invisible or goes unnoticed (Sandoval 2004:442). The process of a child's identity formation in this "third space" is extremely complex and volatile, given the national context of racialized "identity politics" and the different connotations behind words used to label immigrants. For example, the label "nica" as compared to "nicaragüense" is a racialized term that is used pejoratively as an insult even to someone who may not be Nicaraguan. A writer or a politician, then, will be referred to as a "nicaragüense," or better yet, just a good writer or politician. A "nica," on the other hand, is a highly stigmatized term that a Costa Rican might wield in the form "Don't be a nica"[3] (Sandoval 2008:261-262). Likewise, the terms "immigrant" and "foreigner" are selectively applied to groups considered conflictive or poor, whereas European or North American residents will instead be referred to as "investors," "retirees," or "tourists," even though in many ways they fulfill the same criteria of an "immigrant" (Sandoval 2008:262; Sandoval et al. 2010:242).

Sandoval describes extensively in several publications regarding Nicaraguan migration in Costa Rica how Costa Rican national identity is established by its excluding construction of the "Other" and then subsequently being threatened by it. Nicaraguans and immigrants are two of

---

[3] The English equivalent to the phrase would be similar to: "Were you born in a barn? Don't be an idiot"

these groups (among others) that are constructed as the "Other" and then seen as threats to the imaginatively defined "Costa-rican-ness" (Sandoval 2008, 2004, 2002). The role of collective "imagination" of communities is described as well by Leo Chavez as "two-pronged – both from the point of view of immigrants and from the point of view of the host society" (Chavez as summarized in Brettell 2000:105). Alternatively, he also explains how "undocumented immigrants… are not generally regarded as members of the community; they are society's 'Others'…. the larger society often endows the identity, character, and behavior of the illegal alien with mythic qualities" (Chavez 1991:262). Mass communication mediums and intellectual populism are two of the principal perpetuators of these mythical representations of the immigrant "Other" (Sandoval 2004, 2009).

In addition to representational discrimination, there are differences in educational options available for immigrant children. Costa Rica boasts the highest literacy rate in Central America, and schooling has been a major political priority since 1949 (Biesanz 1999:199). However, this has faltered in recent decades, and the quality of education is a serious concern. Quality in education varies significantly according to socioeconomic class, and public schools "are so bad that upper- and upper-middle-class parents wouldn't dream of sending their children there" (Biesanz 1999:211). Schools in urban slum areas, such as La Carpio where my conversation with Laura's mother and the other children mentioned at the beginning of this paper took place, are "in bad condition, too small for the student population, and have insufficient teaching resources" (Marquette 2006:11). This variation in educational quality, plus the fact that a Costa Rican teenager will typically begin having intercourse at age fifteen (for boys) and sixteen (for girls), many without contraception during their first sexual encounter (Biesanz 1999:181-182), makes Laura's mother's concern for her daughter quite reasonable. The other reasons the children gave

are valid as well. Seasonal migration explains why school attendance for immigrants fluctuates, although this is more common in the north near the border (Marquette 2006:11). The end consequence to all these reasons, then, is that only 45% of Nicaraguan secondary school-age children are enrolled compared to 70% of Costa Rican children. This results in material inequity, as lower educational levels are cited as the main cause of lower wages for Nicaraguans compared to Costa Ricans (Marquette 2006:11), thus further entrenching the country in a dual market labor division.

Social Cohesion

Studying how immigrants organize themselves geographically and through social networks shows that kinship and relationships play an important role in social organization for immigrants in their new home. Hagan (1994) describes how Mayan immigrants in Houston make extensive use of social networks to find jobs, places to live, social support, and some resemblance of the social ties they left behind. Social networks can be used strategically to help with difficult processes of settlement and adaptation (Hagan 1994; Brettell 2000:108).

The role of social cohesion is particularly interesting in relation to the phenomenon of slum-like living conditions juxtaposed with wealthy "fortified enclaves." One such shantytown is located on the outskirts of San Jose, Costa Rica. This binational community is called "La Carpio" and is seen from the outside as a "monolithic entity" but by its members more as a "pile of micro-localities" (Wacquant 2001, quoted in Sandoval 2009:160). While in some cases social networks may work to the advantage of immigrants, it is also conceivable that difficulties may arise in communities that are "*organized in a different form* around intense competition and conflict over scarce resources" (Wacquant 2001, quoted in Sandoval 2009:160, emphasis in the

original). The La Carpio community has successfully united on various issues of common interest, including the installment of water facilities and a local school. This is the positive side of the strength behind ethnic solidarity. However, there is danger as well in some of the more violent strains of social cohesion in La Carpio, including eight gang territories that give rise to some of the horror stories and sensationalist reporting that comes out of the area. Sensationalized media reporting, however, fails to take into account that although areas like La Carpio have similarities to what Philippe Bourgois describes when the "law-abiding majority has lost control of public space" (2003:10), there are informalized times when the public space of the streets is safely reclaimed[4].

The implications of these "micro-localities" are quite grave. They may lead to the situation that Sarah Mahler (1995) describes in Long Island, New York in which the pressure to earn surplus income erodes cultural values from home countries of solidarity and cooperation[5]. That is, the pressure for survival may force immigrants to take advantage of each other and erode the strength they garnish from social networks. Mahler describes the tragic consequence when immigrant communities end up directing their anger and frustration not toward the faceless structural layer of exploitation, but on their neighbors instead. It is easier, for example, to direct anger and frustration toward the people and institutions working with and alongside immigrant communities, because the inequality is more visible and present. On a macro level, however, structural violence is faceless and elusive, and thus absolved because it is not clear where to direct one's anger. Mahler writes that her informants in Long Island, New York "perceive themselves as exploited by [coethnic] small-time entrepreneurs; they paint their community in

---

[4] During Christmas Eve and New Year's Eve celebrations, for example

[5] There are also significant differences in the migrant communities of Costa Rica as opposed to those studied by Mahler and Fadiman in the United States. For example, many Nicaraguan immigrants come as families planning to reside permanently in Costa Rica, as opposed to Salvadoran migrants that Mahler interviewed who planned to save up enough surplus income to move back and live more comfortably, and do not always come in a family unit.

shades of abuse while the greater society is largely exonerated" (Mahler 1995:107). She concludes that "the notion of ethnic solidarity must be criticized," because for the immigrant populations she studied in Long Island, New York, they "certainly do not see themselves as united" (Mahler 1995:225). A Hmong refugee in Merced, California recognizes that ethnic cohesiveness is often an idea applied to Hmong refugees from the outside – "if a person outside the community see a Hmong person, they look that way [socially cohesive]. But inside they have guilt. Many feelings of guilt. [After fleeing from north Laos across the Mekong river] you will not be like what you were before you get through the Mekong" (Fadiman 1997:165).

Success for immigrants requires careful, progressive use of the positive aspects of social networks. "Micro-localities" that function as divisive, competitive, or threaten local security will pit local residents against each other and result in greater internal conflict and possibly a more violent local reality. Social networks can function in positive ways as well, by serving as social safety nets, or guiding newcomers and plugging them into job opportunities, and providing a way of reproducing cultural solidarity (similarly to what Hagan [1994] describes in the first chapters of her book).

Inclusion, paradoxical and simultaneous rejection and inclusion

Immigrants play a paradoxical role for host countries. They function in important roles within the economy, yet they are excluded from the imagined community. Undocumented immigrants' contributions to the economy of their host country are often made invisible or overlooked by mainstream society (Chavez 1991:263). In "global cities," which are the geographical and material hubs of the global information economy, "large numbers of low-paid women and immigrants get incorporated into strategic economic sectors" (Sassen 2002:255).

This is certainly the case in Costa Rica, where "Nicaraguan migrants are more economically active than Costa Ricans" yet they "concentrate in lower status and lower paying occupations" (Marquette 2006:6). San José, Costa Rica's capital city, fits what Sassen (2002:259) describes when "domestic tasks are relocated to the market," and "we see the return of the so-called serving classes in all the world's global cities, and these classes are largely made up of immigrant and migrant women." This phenomenon is described quite elegantly in an excerpt from the wildly popular and insightful monologue titled "El Nica" by Cesar Meléndez[6] (2004):

> Forgive me for being in this country looking for work - any kind of work! And one asks himself: what would happen with Costa Rica's golden bean[7] if we weren't here, huh? What would become of the bananas, the sugar cane, the pineapple? Forgive me for the hundreds and hundreds of watchy-mans[8], security guards, street vigilantes, in the streets, the houses, the elementary schools, the high schools, the universities, the churches, the theaters, which for the most part are my fellow countrymen! Surely, you all feel a little uncomfortable knowing that your security is in the hands of people all illiterate and uneducated and violent like us, right[9]? Excuse me for the thousands and thousands and thousands of women who cook for you what you eat every day and are the ones who give a little kiss to your kids when they go to the school and who are the only ones to receive them when they get back from school, because you, the parents, are too busy with your own lives!

The first step, then, toward improving conditions for migrants is to recognize the contribution of immigrant labor and include them in the "imagined community." They are an integral part of the

---

[6] Quotes from the drama were selected from a website and translated by the author of this paper
[7] Coffee, one of Costa Rica's top cash crop, along with bananas
[8] Private guards contracted informally
[9] Private security has increased significantly in many Latin American countries; in Costa Rica private guards outnumber the public police force.

material and physical infrastructure that supports markets, cash crops, tourism, and the information industry.

The second step is to improve and continually reform social services to areas on the "peripheral" rim of global cities. As mentioned previously, educational opportunities have been shown to vary significantly in quality and coverage over the socioeconomic scale. Marquette (2006) concludes that educational services are an even higher priority than health services, because health services actually reach Nicaraguan migrants more effectively than do educational opportunities. In addition, lower educational levels "play a key role in shaping poverty levels among Nicaraguans and in contributing to poverty in Costa Rica as a whole." Increasing enrollment and quality of education should help integration, improve standards of living, and reduce poverty (Marquette 2006:18).

Conclusion

It is midnight, December 31, 2010, and the streets of the La Carpio shantytown have been reclaimed by families and kids who have emptied from their makeshift shelters and run excitedly through the unpaved streets in anticipation of the New Year. Small electric bulbs on the outside of the shacks light the streets, and parked cars illuminate the street with their headlights. A human-sized doll, stuffed with foam and firecrackers and soaked in gasoline, is suspended from a post in the middle of the road. At exactly midnight it is ignited, signifying the death of the old year as it erupts into flames and shrieks as the fireworks inside it go off. The Old Year then falls limply into a smoldering heap on the ground. Loud music from the bars and stereos mixes with shouts of elation as people cheer and kiss each other. Thundering fireworks launched from nearby communities of affluence across the valley explode overhead to celebrate the New Year

with sound and colorful designs. The visual display decorates shared sky above the slums as well as the affluent ex-patriot communities of Escazú to the south and the Cariari luxury villas to the west. The celebratory explosions overhead to usher in the New Year and definitively seal the passing of the old one are a vivid reminder of the close spatial proximity of these vastly separate levels of social class, united by links of economy, cultural celebrations, and common hopes and dreams for their families. It may be easy from time to time for one social stratum to neglect or forget the existence of the others, but this is merely a problem of selective imagination and narrow-minded provincialism. The reality reveals a complex web of human actors and interrelated social structures within which they navigate their daily lives. It is a political ecology in which if one part celebrates, the whole city cheers. And if one part is neglected, the whole community suffers along with it.

Works Cited

Barquero, Jorge A. and Juan C. Vargas
    2004 La Migración Internacional en Costa Rica: Estado Actual y Consecuencias. *In*
        Evolución Demográfica de Costa Rica y su Impacto en Los Sistemas de Salud y Pensiones.
        López, Grettel and Reinaldo Herrera, eds. Pp. 55-85. San José, Costa Rica: Academia de
        Centroamérica.

Basok, Tanya
    1993 Keeping Heads Above Water: Salvadorean Refugees in Costa Rica. Quebec, Canada:
        McGill-Queen's University Press.

Biesanz, Mavis Hiltunen, Richard Biesanz, and Karen Zubris Biesanz
    1999 The Ticos: culture and social change in Costa Rica. London, Lynne Rienner Publishers,
        Inc.

Bourgois, Philippe
    2003 In Search of Respect: Selling Crack in El Barrio. Second edition. New York, New York:
        Cambridge University Press.

Brettell, Caroline B.
    2000 Theorizing Migration in Anthropology: the Social Construction of Networks, Identities,
        Communities, and Globalscapes. *In* Migration Theory. Caroline B. Brettell and James F.
        Hollifield, eds. Pp. 97-122. New York: Routledge.

Chavez, Leo R.
    1991 Outside the Imagined Community: Undocumented Settlers and Experiences of
        Incorporation. American Ethnologist 18(2): 257-278.

Fadiman, Anne
    1997 The Spirit Catches You and You Fall Down. 19 Union Square West,
        New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Fruttero and Wennerholm
    2008 Migración Nicaragüense: un análisis con perspectiva de género. Banco Mundial,
        Washington, DC.

Grundy-Warr and Wong
    2002 Geographies of Displacement: The Karenni and the Shan across the Myanmar-Thailand
        Border. Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography, 23(1): 93-122.

Hagan, Jacqueline Maria
    1994 Deciding to Be Legal. Philadelphia: Temple University Press. Ch. 1, 2, & 3.

Mahler, Sarah J.

1995 American Dreaming: immigrant life in the margins. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Marquette, Catherine M.
2006 Nicaraguan Migrants in Costa Rica. Población y Salud en Mesoamérica 4(1).

Meléndez, Cesar
2004 El Nica. Quotes retrieved and translated by author from Revista Envío Digital 266, May. http:// www.envio.org.ni/articulo/2138, accessed May 6, 2011.

Nygren, Anja
2005 Violent Conflicts and Threatened Lives: Nicaraguan Experiences of Wartime Displacement and Postwar Distress. Journal of Latin American Studies 35:367-393.

Sandoval, Carlos Garcia
2004 Contested Discourses on National Identity: Representing Nicaraguan Immigration in Costa Rica. Bulletin of Lain American Research 23(4): 434-445.
2005 La Carpio. La experiencia de segregación urbana y estigmatización social. Escuela de Comunicación/Instituto de Investigaciones Sociales, Universidad de Costa Rica.
2008 Otros amenazantes. Los nicaraguënses y la formación de identidades nacionales en Costa Rica. San José, Editorial Universidad de Costa Rica.
2009 Narrating Lived Experience in a Binational Community in Costa Rica. *In* Ethnicities and Values in a Changing World. Gargi Bhattacharyya, ed. Pp. 155-168. Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.

Sandoval, Carlos, Mónica Brenes Montoya, Laura Paniagua Arguedas, and Karen Masís Fernández
2010 Un país fragmentado: La Carpio: comunidad, cultura y política. Ciudad Universitaria Rodrigo Facio, Costa Rica: Editorial Universidad de Costa Rica.

Sassen, Saskia
2002 Global Cities and Survival Circuits. In *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy.* Ehrenreich, Barabara and Arlie Russell Hochschild, eds. New York, New York: Henry Holt and Company.